



State Of Arizona
Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board

"Protecting the Public's Health"

1400 West Washington • Suite 230 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Voice Telephone 602-542-8242 • FAX 602-542-3093
TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Janet Napolitano – Governor

Debora Chelson, NMD – Chairman • Renee Waldman, NMD – Vice Chairman • Daniel Rubin, ND- Secretary/Treasurer • Mr. Kip Micuda JD -
- Public Member • Catherine Walker, NMD – Physician Member
Ms. Linda Barron, Public Member • Mr. Evan Zang - Public Member
Craig Runbeck, NMD – Executive Director

BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday October 9th. 2008• 1:00 p.m. • Basement Conference Room B-1
1400 West Washington • Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

- A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meeting.
The meeting was called to order at 1:03 PM.
Presents; Ms. Linda Barron, Dr. Cathy Walker, Mr. Evan Zang, Dr. Daniel Rubin, Dr. Renee Waldman, Dr. Debora Chelson. Mr. Kip Micuda, Absent. 6 Present, 1 Absent
- B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.
Present; Dr. Craig Runbeck; Executive Director, Ms. Elizabeth Campbell; Assistant Attorney General, Ms. Gail Anthony; Investigations and Licensing.

2. Call to the Public

No Public wished to address the Board.

3. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Consent Agenda

- A. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Minutes of July 10, 2008**
The Board voted to approve the minutes of the July 10th 2008 meeting.
- B. **ED. Report**
The Board voted to approve the Executive Director Report.

C. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Medical License(s) / Examination Application

| | |
|--|------------------|
| Terrie Barrett | Matthew Cavaiola |
| Judy Hinojosa-Sinks | Kathleen Dang |
| Andrew Dickens, Pending Receipt of Passing NPLEX Scores (B/S). | Victoria Green |
| Karlee Heffner | Rachel Rhodes |
| Jennifer Kaumeyer | Cori Kennedy |
| Jamie Oskin | Benita Perch |
| Esther Perreault | Erin Fitzgerald |
| Sasha Blissett, | Kenna Barber |
| Meghna Thacker, Pending Receipt of Clean Background Report(s). | Laurie Moody |

| | |
|--|--|
| Cheryl Sly, Pending Receipt of Clean Background Report(s). | Tiffany Taylor, Pending Receipt of Clean Background Report(s). |
|--|--|

The Board voted to approved the applications for medical license(s).

D. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Temporary License(s) to Practice Medicine

| | |
|----------------|--|
| Ariel Policano | |
|----------------|--|

The Board voted to approved the issuance of the temporary license(s).

E. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Medical License(s) / Endorsement

| | |
|----------------|--|
| Ariel Policano | |
|----------------|--|

The Board voted to approve the medial license(s) by endorsement.

F. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Medical License

| | |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Autumn Holder | Sonja De Graaff |
| Scott Jamison | Deborah Rogalla |
| Allyn Krieger-Fiedler | Mark James |
| Melissa Dawahare | Jorge Badillo Cochran |
| Roger Adair | Nicole Barreda |
| Courtney Cronin | Judith Stolz |
| Mark James | Damien Brandeis |

The Board voted to approved the renewal of the medical license(s).

G. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Conduct a Preceptorship Training Program

| | |
|--------------|----------------|
| Decker Weiss | Jason Porter |
| Abdul Memon | Carole Jamison |

The Board voted to approved the certificate(s) to conduct a preceptorship training program.

H. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Engage in a Preceptorship Training Program

| | |
|------------------|-----------------|
| Esther Perreault | Matthew Cavaola |
| Terrie Barrett | Cori Kennedy |
| Jamie Oskin | Lauri Moody |

I. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Dispense (initial)

| | |
|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Todd Smith | Mark Corbin (Reinstatement) |
| Robyn Conte (Reinstatement) | Sandy Colvard |
| MaryK Martin Geyer | Matthew Mitchell |

The Board voted to approve the issuance of the initial certificate(s) to dispense.

J. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Dispense

| | |
|---------------------|-----------------|
| Nicole Taylor | Nancy Horner |
| Lawrence Helms, Jr. | Jennifer Nevels |
| Mona Morstein | Shawn Joyner |
| Nicole Barreda | Boris Schwartz |
| Aimee Bachelier | Ben Zorensky |

| | |
|-----------------------|-------------------|
| Gladys Ceballos-Logan | Laura Sickels |
| Bryan McConnell | Timothy Schwaiger |
| Cheryl Derooin | James Hutton |
| Ross Kerievsky | Laura Kennedy |
| Yvonne Skinner | Vance Inouye |
| Robert Gear | Jeffery Knytych |
| Miriam Gilbert | Todd Smith |
| Allen Anderson | Lois Eaton |
| Tara Swartz | Lisa Richardson |
| Miriam Weber | Ross Dunbar |
| Carolyn Groves | Timothy Visser |
| Kami Winchell | Lance Hering |
| Murray Dowell | Mark Tenborg |
| Adam Kerievsky | Tracy Wooten |
| Jason Jensen | Gilberto Leao |
| Carlos Santo | Shane Johnson |
| Donald Mayfield | Miriam Gilbert |
| Nicole Barreda | William Troutt |
| Bryan McConnell | Allen Anderson |
| James Hutton | Lisa Richardson |
| Yvonne Skinner | Vance Inouye |
| Lance Hering | Theresa Ramsey |
| Eugene Eihausen | Katarina Novakova |
| Aimee Bachelier | James Tuggle |
| LoRal Linton | Shawn Joyner |
| Garrett Wdowin | Judith Stolz |
| Sarv Varta Khalsa | Elizabeth Grady |
| Brendan McCarthy | Kimberly Volk |
| Amy Whittington | |

The Board voted to approve the renewal of the certificate(s) to dispense.

K. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) for Certificate for Medical Assistant

| | |
|--------------------------|---------------------------|
| Christina Gear (Renewal) | Jessica Smalley (Renewal) |
| Lucia Diaz (Renewal) | Shawn Smetzer (Renewal) |
| Dustin Walters (Renewal) | |

The Board voted to approve the issuance of the medical assistant certificate(s).

L. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

| | |
|-------------------|-------------------|
| Kelly Simms | Abigail Marinack |
| Stephanie Nishek | Margaret Steele |
| Kimberly Caravone | Ragheb Alami |
| Sean Hesler | Nazanin Vassighi |
| Katrina Stage | Ashley Mayer |
| Daniel Larke | Jennifer Southard |
| Lahnor Ridley | Richard Petke |
| Doug Cutler | Jessica Hayman |
| Dawn Dalili | Heath McAllister |
| Michelle Smekens | Kelly Bassett |
| Mahadi Brown | Shannon Treen |
| Anh Upchurch | John Williamson |
| Ruby Crozier | Margaret Walsh |

| | |
|---------------------|---------------------|
| April Syko | Jacqueline Rho |
| Kenneth Mitchell | Andrea Lacoss |
| Lucas Tims | Corrie Thompson |
| Monique Chhun | Gemie Kohler |
| Barrie Zeller | Maleigha Watts |
| Stephanie Seitz | Leslie Cisar |
| Karla Walker | Eric Cerre |
| Shawngela Pierce | Jean-Louis Yves |
| Eric Latham | Andrea O'Connor |
| Sonal Patel | Jean Luis leProvost |
| Christopher Ogilvie | Kiera Smialrk |
| Julie Edling | Trevor George |
| Cynthia Peterson | Kenneth Lashutka |
| Andras Bucsinszky | Adam Tice |
| Shawngela Pierce | |

The Board voted to approve the issuance of the certificate(s) to engage in clinical training.

M. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

| | |
|------------------|------------------|
| Stephanie Gajus | Annette D'Armata |
| Justin Taylor | Cathy Forbes |
| R. Ruddy | Kristen Fujii |
| Charmonique Tims | Amanda Frick |
| Tredena Young | Ayanna Quamina |
| Tamara Dickson | Kirsten West |
| Shaylind Benson | Leytocha Price |

The Board voted to approve the issuance of the renewed certificate(s) to engage in clinical training.

Dr. Walker moved to accept the consent agenda.

Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

4. Regulatory Matters

A. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Investigations and Complaints. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

(1) Dr. Jesse Haggard, Case No. 07-005, Formal Hearing

Present were: Ms. Campbell, Assistant Attorney General, representing the State of Arizona.

Mr. Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, representing the Board. Dr. Haggard was not present. There was no counsel present representing Dr. Haggard. After swearing in of the State's witnesses, Ms Anthony was called to testify. After a brief presentation by the Assistant Attorney General, the Chair decided to continue the hearing until December.

(2) Dr. Christina Kovalik, Case No. 08-009 – Formal Interview, Review of Consent Agreement

Dr. Kovalik was present with her Counsel Ms. Bianca Leder. Ms. Leder made statements to the Board on behalf of Dr. Kovalik. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Walker moved to request staff to draft a consent agreement and order, withdrawing the order of probationary time period, and accepting the 119.25 additional clinical rotation and educational hours, that the Respondent has already voluntarily completed. Second by Dr. Waldman. Roll Call: Ms. Barron; Aye, Dr. Walker; Aye, Mr. Zang; Aye, Dr. Rubin; Aye, Dr. Chelson; Aye, Dr. Waldman; Aye. Motion carried 6 Ayes 1 Absent.

(3) Dr. Eric Hampton, Case No. 07-013 – Formal Interview, Review of Consent Agreement

Dr. Hampton was not present. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Walker moved to approve the consent agreement as written. Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

(4) Dr. Leslie Marcum, Case No. 08-016 (LB) Formal Interview (This item was taken into consideration by the Board after item(s) B (1, 2,3,) C (1,2) and D (1)

Dr. Marcum was present, made statements and answered questions. The complainant (LB) was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron moved to issue a letter of concern regarding ethical issue of continuance of patient care. Second by Mr. Zang. Roll Call: Ms. Barron; Aye, Dr. Walker; Nay, Mr. Zang; Aye, Dr. Rubin; Aye, Dr. Chelson, Aye, Dr. Waldman; (absent during the time of the vote). Motion carried 4 Ayes, 1 Nay, 2 Absent. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron moved to issue a non-disciplinary Board order instructing Dr. Marcum to complete 8 hours of continuing medical education in physician responsibilities and ethics concerning continuance of patient care. Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried, 4 Ayes, 1 Nay, 2 Absent.

B. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Persons Licensed by this Board. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

(1) Dr. Hanna Ian, Request for Extension on Ordered Clinical Training Hours.

Dr. Walker recused herself. Dr. Ian was not present. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron moved to issue a complaint for non-compliance of Board order regarding case no. 07-011, and bring the case back to the Board for Formal Interview. Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

(2) Dr. Catherine Walker, Application for Renewal of Medical License

Dr. Walker recused herself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Waldman moved to renew the medial license. Second by Dr. Chelson. Motion carried 5Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

(3) Dr. Samuel Walker, Application for Renewal of Medical License.

Dr. Walker recused herself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron moved to renew the medial license. Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried 5Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent

C. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board regarding applications

(1) Melissa Coats, Application for Preceptorship with Dr. Daniel Rubin

Dr. Rubin recused himself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Waldman moved to accept the application for preceptorship. Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 5 ayes, 1 Recused 1 Absent.

(2) Lisa Alschuler, Application for Certificate to Dispense. Office of Dr. Daniel Rubin.

Dr. Rubin recused himself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Waldman moved to accept the application for preceptorship. Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

D. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Persons Applying for Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

(1) Kathleen Condry

Ms. Condry was presents. Made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Walker moved to issue the certificate to engage in clinical training. Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

ADJOURNMENT
THE MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:50 PM